



# AGENDA

**NOTE: In the case of non-members, this agenda is for information only**

- Committee - **JOINT AUDIT & SCRUTINY PANEL**
- Date & Time - **TUESDAY, 12TH APRIL, 2011 AT 9.00 AM**
- Venue - **ANGLIA ROOM, CONFERENCE SUITE, ELIZABETH HOUSE, DEREHAM NR19 1EE**

**Members of the Committee requiring further information, or with specific questions, are asked to raise these with the appropriate officer at least two working days before the meeting. If the information requested is available, this will be provided, and reported to Committee.**

#### The Panel

Mr S.G. Bambridge  
Councillor Claire Bowes  
Mr R.P. Childerhouse

Mr J.P. Cowen (Chairman)  
Mr C.R. Jordan  
Mr D.S. Myers

**PERSONS ATTENDING THE MEETING ARE REQUESTED TO TURN OFF MOBILE TELEPHONES**

Member Services  
Elizabeth House, Walpole Loke,  
Dereham Norfolk, NR19 1EE

Date: 5 April 2011

**PART A - ITEMS OPEN TO THE PUBLIC**

|   | <u>Page(s)</u><br><u>herewith</u> |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| <p>1. <b><u>MINUTES</u></b><br/>To confirm the minutes of the meeting held on 2 March 2011.</p>   | 1 - 3                             |
| <p>2. <b><u>APOLOGIES</u></b><br/>To receive any apologies for absence.</p>   |                                   |
| <p>3. <b><u>DECLARATIONS</u></b><br/>Members are asked at this stage to declare any interests that they may have in any of the following items on the agenda. The Members' Code of Conduct requires that declarations include the nature of the interest and whether it is a personal or prejudicial interest.</p>  |                                   |
| <p>4. <b><u>NON-MEMBERS WISHING TO ADDRESS THE MEETING</u></b><br/>To note the names of any non-members wishing to address the meeting.</p>   |                                   |
| <p>5. <b><u>MEMBERS ICT OPTIONS</u></b><br/>The following documents are attached:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Amended report on Members' ICT Options</li><li>▪ Briefing note on Members' Allowance</li><li>▪ Draft Minutes of the Special Business Improvement Sub-Committee meeting held on 30 March 2011</li></ul> <p>To ensure that Members receive accurate and up-to-date figures, not available at this time, additional information will be provided at the meeting.</p> | 4 - 20                            |

**BRECKLAND COUNCIL**

**At a Meeting of the**

**JOINT AUDIT & SCRUTINY PANEL**

**Held on Wednesday, 2 March 2011 at 10.00 am in  
St George's Room, Elizabeth House, Walpole Loke, Dereham**

**PRESENT**

Mr S.G. Bambridge  
Councillor Claire Bowes

Mr J.P. Cowen (Chairman)

**In Attendance**

Adam Colby

Mark Finch

Helen McAleer

Teresa Smith

Kevin J Taylor

- Senior Business Improvement Officer

- Head of Finance

- Senior Committee Officer

- Committee Officer

- Head of ICT

**Action By**

**1/11 MINUTES**

The Minutes of the meeting held on 14 December 2010 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

**2/11 APOLOGIES**

Apologies for absence had been received from Mr R Childerhouse and Mr C Jordan.

**3/11 DECLARATION OF INTEREST**

There were none.

**4/11 NON-MEMBERS WISHING TO ADDRESS THE MEETING**

There were none.

**5/11 MEMBERS ICT OPTIONS**

The Head of ICT advised Members that attempts to obtain trial iPads on loan had been unsuccessful, and due to the costs there was a reluctance to spend money on such devices until their viability had been proven. Therefore, the Business Improvement Team had prepared a Business Case for a number of options for new/replacement ICT equipment.

The Senior Business Improvement Officer then presented the report which looked at six options against set objectives with a breakdown of the costs including hardware, software, training, support, printer and postage costs, but not including depreciation.

**Action By**

The sixth option, which was for an allowance, was based on information provided by Compass Point. It was noted that this option might have tax implications.

An additional option was the Kindle, which was light, portable and had good battery life. These were currently being trialled by the Deputy Chief Executive and the Director of Corporate Resources.

With regard to the red traffic light ratings, the Chairman was interested in learning more about the business cases of two other local authorities, known to be trialling iPads. He asked for information on what Leicester and Warrington were doing and why. The report needed to contain more supporting information to explain the findings.

**Kevin J  
Taylor**

The Panel was under pressure to get the right solution to ensure that new Councillors would be able to function from day one. He suggested that any option that did not meet the basic requirements of a Member should be discounted.

The Head of ICT noted that one of the main aims was to reduce costs by significantly reducing printing (and that this would require a cultural change in the way of working for Members).

The Chairman acknowledged this but reiterated that the aim was to reduce printing, not to eliminate it totally, bearing in mind that a solution needed to provide 'as is' capability (ie would allow annotation of documents when on the train – without wider connectivity). Members agreed unanimously; although they were aware that highlighting and annotation could be done electronically they were not yet at the point of being able to do without paper copies of agendas.

Members needed to be given the right tools to allow them to do their job efficiently and the Business Case needed to consider both financial and practical aspects.

The Head of ICT agreed. The options under consideration gave Members flexibility and allowed choice and given different needs, no one size would fit all although all agreed that a single 'best fit' would be preferable.

The various options were considered and the following comments were made:

- iPads – red ratings needed more information to explain the findings, however proposed costs were prohibitive
- Chip PCs – should be discounted because they were not portable and Members needed to be able to work in a variety of locations
- Duo's – appeared flimsy and might have long term maintenance issues
- Kindles – should be discounted because they did not have a print capability and could not display in colour

**Action By**

It was noted that Options 3, 4 and 5 were currently affordable. The Head of Finance explained that the £50,000 figure was based on the Refresh budget, but that this could be stretched as there was more available.

Members considered that Option 1 (Laptop – with wireless capability) and Option 4 (Netbook with additional screen, keyboard and mouse) would meet the majority of needs.

If an allowance was to be paid it would need to be more than £400 for the first year – to allow for the purchase of hardware, etc, but then less for the following years. Costs would be inclusive of maintenance (to be arranged by Members).

The Head of Finance advised that if an allowance was to be proposed it would have to be approved by the Members' Remuneration Panel.

In conclusion the Chairman said that options needed to be fully worked up to give the Business Improvement Sub-Committee sufficient information to make a choice and to get the equipment in time for the new Members induction day on 12 May.

The Head of ICT said that it might be possible to get some devices in and ready to go so that new Members who did not have their own PCs would be on-line from day one and those that did have their own equipment could potentially be provided with Citrix connectivity to begin with, allowing kit issue to be staggered.

The Senior Business Improvement Officer noted that there might be an opportunity to reduce the support provided to Members which would be a tangible cost saving. The Head of ICT agreed and thought that the overall cost of support to Members and of paper produced was likely to reduce due to the provision of new equipment whilst also delivering an improved service.

However, it was pointed out that Members were different to Officers and needed a different degree of support which included 'out of hours' assistance. They would therefore oppose the loss of direct Member support.

It was **RESOLVED** that the Audit Committee and Overview & Scrutiny Commission be advised that the Panel did not support Options 2, 3 and 5. Options 1 OR 4 and Option 6 were supported.

The meeting closed at 11.17 am

CHAIRMAN

**Report of the Director of Corporate Resources - Maxine O'Mahony**

**AMENDED version of the report to Joint Audit & Scrutiny Panel (Members ICT) 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2011  
(amended to reflect comments made by Members at the meeting)**

**Councillor ICT Options**

**1. Purpose of Report**

This document provides a review of a number of options for new/replacement ICT equipment for members taking effect from the May 2011 elections. It provides an overview of how the equipment may or may not meet Council and member requirements and the associated costs and benefits attributed to each.

This report forms a discussion around the options available for the provision of ICT equipment to members in the new electoral year.

**2. Recommendations**

It is recommended that the Council/Committee:

- 2.1 Review all of the options as set out below with regards to Member ICT.
- 2.2 Select and determine the most suitable option for new member ICT.

**Note:** In preparing this report, due regard has been had to equality of opportunity, human rights, prevention of crime and disorder, environmental and risk management considerations as appropriate. Relevant officers have been consulted in relation to any legal, financial or human resources implications and comments received are reflected in the report.

**3. Information, Issues and Options**

**3.1 Background**

- 3.1.1 Breckland Council has 54 members, 7 of which are executive members. Councillors currently have a Breckland provided broadband with a laptop and associated equipment such as mouse, keyboard, screen etc and the provision of a printer. Members currently access the Council system using a Citrix connection in order for the Council to be compliant with Government Connect (GCSX).
- 3.1.2 Member's equipment is ageing and there hasn't been a refresh programme for sometime. As a result of this there is an inconsistency in equipment and reliability. Members have a dedicated post providing localised ICT support as a result of being unhappy with the service provided within the Steria contract, although contractually, this function is still provided.
- 3.1.3 In May 2011, a district election will be held and all ICT services will be in sourced. This will provide an opportunity to review and replace the equipment and existing support arrangements whilst ensuring Councillors are given the necessary tools to be effective within their roles.

**3.2 Options**

The requirements below outline what Councillors need to enable them to be effective within their role. This also takes into consideration the parameters set by the business in terms of governance and seeks to identify opportunities where savings could be made.

- 3.2.1 Each option is assessed against the points below.

**For a Councillor**

- Ability to receive agendas online
- Ability to read and view agendas electronically
- Ability to make notes and comment on agendas electronically
- A solution that is portable
- A solution that has connectivity to Council systems
- The facility to communicate using a web camera
- Easy to use, intuitive and reliable

**The ICT Solution**

- Provide accessibility using Citrix
- GCSX compliant
- Ability to access Microsoft Outlook
- Internet access
- Access to MS Word, MS Excel, PDF Reader
- Web camera

**Finance**

- Doesn't exceed the current allocated budget.
- Low training costs and time for members and ICT
- Low installation costs and set up time
- Reduce or remove localised support
- Reduce or remove postage and paper
- Reduce or remove the need for localised printers and the associated support
- Ability to support remotely

The table below provides a breakdown of the different objectives that the replacement ICT solution should meet to enable members to be effective in their roles. Each option also presents the cost over a four year period. Any cost is indicative and subject to the pricing at the time of purchase. The costs do not take into consideration net present value (depreciation costs of equipment and inflation).

| Option | Type          | Description   |
|--------|---------------|---|
| 1      | Laptop (AsIs) | Use the current hardware and software arrangements. Including a refresh of all member laptops and replacing with similar devices.   |
| 2      | Ipads         | Purchase Ipads for all members replacing current equipment.   |
| 3      | Chip PC       | Purchase a Chip PC terminal including a mouse, screen and keyboard with no base unit or laptop.   |
| 4      | Netbooks      | Purchase Netbooks (mini laptops) for all members with an additional screen, keyboard and mouse.   |
| 5      | Duos          | Purchase Duos (mini laptop with reversible touch screen) with an additional screen, keyboard and mouse.   |
| 6      | Allowance     | Provide an annual allowance to cover ICT equipment and consumables (currently based on £1200 over three years) for members to supply their own of their personal choice subject to meeting the minimum pre-requisites of the equipment that would be provided and validated by ICT. |

3.3 Option 1 - Laptop

- Include the issuance of a new laptop (Dell Latitude E-series) with updated features such as wireless connectivity
- Continue provision of broadband
- Supply of consumables
- Provision of local and remote support when required
- Compliance with Government Connect



### 3.4 Option 2 – Ipad

- The Ipad is a tablet designed PC, developed and marketed by Apple primarily as a platform for audio-visual media.
- Continue provision of broadband
- Supply of consumables
- Provision of local and remote support when required

#### Issues

- Ipads being compliant with Government Connect varies depending on the existing ICT infrastructure and procedures within an authority and subject to certification from Siemens Enterprise/OGC along with the intention of use.
- Iphones are non compliant as these do not meet the current requirements of data encryption and security.
- MS Outlook can not be installed on an Ipad as there is currently no version developed.
- MS Office isn't developed for Ipad however the latest information sourced, is that Microsoft are possibly investigating development however nothing is confirmed through a Microsoft source.
- It is not possible to support an Ipad remotely (with the exception of anything stored within the Citrix profile). A remote desktop application has not been developed.



### 3.5 Option 3 – Chip PC

- Chip PCs are also known as thin clients
- They can be plugged into any broadband connection however a mouse, screen and keyboard would be required.



- Continue provision of broadband
- Supply of consumables
- Provision of local and remote support when required
- Compliance with Government Connect
- The Chip PC would be supplied with a screen, mouse and keyboard plugged into the small device
- Low energy consumption
- Easy to use and intuitive.
- Chips PCs are already in use across other authorities for officers and members. Forest Heath members currently use a Chip PC solution.
- These have recently been issues to Forest Heath members and have reduced the need for support.

#### Issues

- The device is limited in terms of portability. It can be moved and used any site with a broadband connection however it does then need a screen, mouse and keyboard.
- Should there be no broadband connection, the system can not be used.



### 3.6 Option 4 – Netbooks

- Netbooks are essentially mini laptop: more portable, smaller in size and lighter, Netbooks also have a longer battery life than a conventional laptop.
- Continue provision of broadband
- Supply of consumables
- Provision of local and remote support when required
- Provisions of an additional screen mouse and keyboard.

#### Issues

- There is no CD drive however any large Council documents that are not emailable can easily be deposited on the extranet or internet and a URL provided.



### 3.7 Option 5 – Duo Netbook

- A Duo Netbook is similar to the netbook above but includes a touch screen and allows the user to twist and fold the screen to use the device as you would a tablet. The duo is larger than a netbook.
- Continue provision of broadband
- Supply of consumables
- Provision of local and remote support when required
- Provision of an additional screen, mouse and keyboard

#### Issues

- The devices are new to the market so there is little known about durability and potential faults
- Based on the demo version received, the device is flimsy and could result in either additional support in terms of replacement or repair, or early replacement of equipment.
- There is no CD drive however any large Council documents that are not emailable can easily be deposited on the extranet or internet and a URL provided.



### 3.8 Option 6 – Member Allowance

- Provide members with an annual allowance to source, supply and support their own equipment
- Provide access to the Council systems through Citrix
- Provide remote support for Council systems within Citrix

- Provide a minimum specification to ensure the ICT solution selected will meet Council business needs
- Validate pre-purchase to ensure above.
- Lets members choose the solution best for them (within the minimum specification)
- Removes the need for those members that may have more than one home computer to have multiple.
- Potential to reduce the Council budget in terms of support and supply of consumables

#### Issues

- Further work would be required to determine inclusion and exclusions and put forward a recommended allowance.
- A recommendation would have to be approved through the Councils Remuneration Panel who would put forward a recommendation to Council for approval. This needs to be done sooner rather than later prior to the panel being disbanded.
- If selected as one of two options, it may cost more to deliver due to the provision of two services to members unless a pro-rata reduction in support can be made.
- Validation has been requested with regard to the Government Connect policy to ensure there are no imminent changes due which would effect this option should it be pursued.

#### Broadland District Council: Member Allowance Information

The following provides an overview of what Broadland Council provide in terms of Member Allowance for ICT. If adopted, the inclusions, exclusions and amounts would need to be decided and the appropriate allowance decided. This is not a conclusion to the option.

##### What does it include?

- Broadband
- Provision of PC
- Small printer
- Consumables such as ink

##### How is it calculated?

- Relates to one fifth of the total cost with a percentage for inflation added each year

##### What do they not do?

- The amount isn't front loaded
- No minimum specifications have been provided to members

##### What support arrangements are in place?

- Telephony based advice. Most enquiries relate only to access to Council email

##### What is the allowance?

- 2011 allowance is calculated at £320

##### Government Connect

- Information has been requested to ensure that if member allowances were provided for the sourcing of their own ICT, that no future changes are scheduled for changes in the government connect policy which would potentially effect this in terms of delivery as an option.

#### *Information provided by ICT Manager at Broadland District Council*

### 3.9 Options Analysis

Each option also presents the cost over a four year period. Any cost is indicative and subject to the pricing at the time of purchase. The costs do not take into consideration net present value (depreciation costs of equipment and inflation). The costs are presented on the basis of the cost to the business, including internal support etc, as opposed to the cost of the provision of hardware only.

Cost for the provision of broadband is not included as this doesn't form part of the option appraisal however this is something that should be reviewed and could be reviewed as part of option 6. Costs for ICT equipment have been provided by the ICT department.

**Key**  
 Green Meets requirements  
 Orange Partially meets requirements  
 Red Doesn't meet requirements

|                    | Description  | Option1 Laptop     | Option 2 Ipad      | Option 3 Chip PC  | Option 4 Netbook   | Option 5 Duo       | Option 6 Allowance |
|--------------------|--|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Councillor         | Ability to receive agendas online  | Green              | Green              | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Ability to read and view agendas electronically                          | Green              | Green              | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Ability to make notes and comment on agendas electronically              | Green              | Green              | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | A solution that is portable  | Yellow             | Green              | Red               | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | A solution that that has connectivity to Council systems                 | Green              | Yellow             | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | The facility to communicate using a web camera                           | Green              | Green              | Yellow            | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Easy to use, intuitive and reliable                                      | Yellow             | Yellow             | Yellow            | Yellow             | Yellow             | Yellow             |
| ICT Solution       | Must provide accessibility using Citrix                                  | Green              | Green              | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Must be GCSX compliant   | Green              | Yellow             | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Includes access Microsoft Outlook  | Green              | Red                | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Internet access/WIFI   | Green              | Green              | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Ability to use MS Word, MS Excel, PDF Reader                             | Green              | Red                | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Ability to support remotely  | Green              | Red                | Green             | Green              | Green              | Grey               |
| Financial Benefits | Low training costs and time for members and ICT                          | Yellow             | Red                | Green             | Yellow             | Yellow             | Green              |
|                    | Low installation costs and set up time                                   | Green              | Red                | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Reduce/remove localised support  | Green              | Red                | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Reduce/remove postage and paper  | Yellow             | Yellow             | Red               | Yellow             | Yellow             | Yellow             |
|                    | Reduce/remove the need for localised printers and the associated support | Yellow             | Yellow             | Yellow            | Yellow             | Yellow             | Yellow             |
|                    | Ability to support software remotely                                     | Green              | Red                | Green             | Green              | Green              | Green              |
|                    | Ability to support hardware remotely                                     | Red                | Red                | Red               | Red                | Red                | Grey               |
| 4 Year Cost        | Hardware and Software Costs  | £58,956.10         | £139,988.12        | £9,527.99         | £30,146.22         | £48,965.97         | £64,800.00         |
|                    | ICT Support Costs  | £158,291.88        | £163,554.54        | £362.66           | £158,654.54        | £158,654.54        | £362.66            |
|                    | Cost with continued Paper, Printing and Postage                          | £87,348.93         | £87,348.93         | £87,348.93        | £87,348.93         | £87,348.93         | £0.00              |
|                    | <b>Total Cost over four years</b>  | <b>£304,596.91</b> | <b>£390,891.59</b> | <b>£98,239.58</b> | <b>£276,149.69</b> | <b>£294,969.44</b> | <b>£65,162.66</b>  |

\* Grey is non applicable

- The current cost for paper, printers and postage for members is approx £16,771.00 per annum.
- The average cost for ICT support per member is approx £552.12 per annum
- If members are keen to look at reducing the associated costs of paper, printing and postage, it could be worthwhile investigating the possibilities of using document reading devices such as a Kindle however a number of the options already presented do provide a portable solution.
- Members would need training regardless of the option selected. It is envisaged that this would take place prior to the release of any new equipment or funding.

### 3.10 Reasons for Recommendation(s)

3.10.1 To provide members with an overview of the options available for replacement ICT equipment along with the associated costs and effort to implement.

3.10.2 To understand the associated benefits and dis-benefits with each option that is available.

3.10.3 To understand the options that may require a change in culture as well as ICT.

## 4. Risk and Financial Implications

### 4.1 Risk

- Members' do not agree on a common solution that meets the majority of member needs.
- A solution is selected that does not meet the required criteria.
- Opportunities for cashable savings that are identified are not realised.
- A solution selected and implemented is not used in the way intended or fully utilised to the intention of its supply, therefore not realising the benefits (cashable and non cashable) associated to that option.

### 4.2 Financial

There may be a tax issues that we would need to clarified with HMRC and against the Local Authorities (Members' Allowances) Regulations 1991 and the Local Authorities (Members Allowances) (England) Regulations 2001 and 2003.

## 5. Legal Implications

5.1 None

## 6. Other Implications

- a) Equalities:
- b) Section 17, Crime & Disorder Act 1998:
- c) Section 40, Natural Environment & Rural Communities Act 2006:
- d) Human Resources:
- e) Human Rights:
- f) Other: [e.g. Children's Act 2004]

## 7. Alignment to Council Priorities

7.1 Environment & Entrepreneurial Council

## 8. Ward/Community Affected

8.1 None

### Lead Contact Officer:

*Name/Post: Adam Colby, Senior Snr Business Improvement Officer (with ICT information provided by ICT Manager, Kevin Taylor)*

*Telephone: 01362 656881*

*Email: adam.colby@breckland.gov.uk*

Key Decision Status (Executive Decisions only): Not a key decision

Appendices attached to this report:

*Appendix12 – Financial Options*

## Appendix 1 – Financial Options

Each table provides an overview of the cost breakdown for each option. The ICT Support is pro-rata across Steria and Breckland.

| 1. Current Set Up: No Change                     |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
|--|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|  | Year 0             | Year 1              | Year 2              | Year 3              | Year 4              |
| <b>Hardware And Accessories</b>                  |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Hardware costs                                   | -£29,700.00        | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Additional devices (e.g. mouse, printer, screen) | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Annual service charge                            | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Replacement Hardware Costs                       | £0.00              | -£6,993.00          | -£7,202.79          | -£7,418.87          | -£7,641.44          |
| <b>Software and Security</b>                     |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Warranty for hardware                            | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Security/GCSX                                    | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Software licence costs                           | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Printing and Postage</b>                      |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Printing costs for agendas and reports           | -£9,586.29         | -£9,873.88          | -£10,170.10         | -£10,475.20         | -£10,789.45         |
| Postage costs for agendas and reports            | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          |
| Member's toner costs                             | -£1,713.69         | -£1,765.10          | -£1,818.05          | -£1,872.60          | -£1,928.77          |
| <b>Additional Support</b>                        |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| ICT support costs                                | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| ICT Member Support (dedicated post)              | -£29,815.00        | -£30,709.45         | -£31,630.73         | -£32,579.66         | -£33,557.05         |
| Internal training costs                          | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total Expenditure</b>                         | <b>-£76,286.14</b> | <b>-£54,812.59</b>  | <b>-£56,292.83</b>  | <b>-£57,817.48</b>  | <b>-£59,387.87</b>  |
| Income   | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total</b>                                     | <b>-£76,286.14</b> | <b>-£54,812.59</b>  | <b>-£56,292.83</b>  | <b>-£57,817.48</b>  | <b>-£59,387.87</b>  |
| <b>Cumulative Total</b>                          | <b>-£76,286.14</b> | <b>-£131,098.73</b> | <b>-£187,391.56</b> | <b>-£245,209.04</b> | <b>-£304,596.92</b> |

| 2. I pads                                      |                     |                     |                     |                     |                     |
|--|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|  | Year 0              | Year 1              | Year 2              | Year 3              | Year 4              |
| <b>Hardware And Accessories</b>                |                     |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Hardware costs                                 | -£32,124.06         | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Additional devices (e.g. mouse, printer, case) | -£16,146.00         | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Annual service charge                          | -£3,906.36          | -£4,023.55          | -£4,144.26          | -£4,268.59          | -£4,396.64          |
| Replacement Hardware Costs                     | £0.00               | -£8,045.01          | -£8,286.36          | -£8,534.95          | -£8,791.00          |
| <b>Software and Security</b>                   |                     |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Server/Hardware                                | -£4,000.00          | -£400.00            | -£412.00            | -£424.36            | -£437.09            |
| Security/GCSX                                  | -£2,100.00          | -£210.00            | -£216.30            | -£222.79            | -£229.47            |
| Software licence costs                         | -£5,400.00          | -£5,562.00          | -£5,728.86          | -£5,900.73          | -£6,077.75          |
| <b>Printing and Postage</b>                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Printing costs for agendas and reports         | -£9,586.29          | -£9,873.88          | -£10,170.10         | -£10,475.20         | -£10,789.45         |
| Postage costs for agendas and reports          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          |
| Member's toner costs                           | -£1,713.69          | -£1,765.10          | -£1,818.05          | -£1,872.60          | -£1,928.77          |
| <b>Internal Support</b>                        |                     |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| ICT Training Costs                             | -£4,900.00          | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| ICT Member Support (dedicated post)            | -£29,815.00         | -£30,709.45         | -£31,630.73         | -£32,579.66         | -£33,557.05         |
| Member Training Costs                          | -£362.66            | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total Expenditure</b>                       | <b>-£115,525.22</b> | <b>-£66,060.15</b>  | <b>-£67,877.82</b>  | <b>-£69,750.02</b>  | <b>-£71,678.39</b>  |
| Income   | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total</b>                                   | <b>-£115,525.22</b> | <b>-£66,060.15</b>  | <b>-£67,877.82</b>  | <b>-£69,750.02</b>  | <b>-£71,678.39</b>  |
| <b>Cumulative Total</b>                        | <b>-£115,525.22</b> | <b>-£181,585.37</b> | <b>-£249,463.19</b> | <b>-£319,213.21</b> | <b>-£390,891.60</b> |

| 3. Chip PC                                       |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
|--|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
|  | Year 0             | Year 1             | Year 2             | Year 3             | Year 4             |
| <b>Hardware And Accessories</b>                  |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| Hardware costs                                   | -£3,240.00         | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Additional devices (e.g. mouse, printer, screen) | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Annual service charge                            | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Replacement Hardware Costs                       | £0.00              | -£1,503.00         | -£1,548.09         | -£1,594.53         | -£1,642.37         |
| <b>Software and Security</b>                     |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| Warranty for hardware                            | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Security/GCSX                                    | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Software licence costs                           | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Printing and Postage</b>                      |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| Printing costs for agendas and reports           | -£9,586.29         | -£9,873.88         | -£10,170.10        | -£10,475.20        | -£10,789.45        |
| Postage costs for agendas and reports            | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16         |
| Member's toner costs                             | -£1,713.69         | -£1,765.10         | -£1,818.05         | -£1,872.60         | -£1,928.77         |
| <b>Internal Support</b>                          |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| ICT Member Support (dedicated post)              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Member Training Costs                            | -£362.66           | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Internal training costs                          | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Total Expenditure</b>                         | <b>-£20,373.80</b> | <b>-£18,613.14</b> | <b>-£19,007.40</b> | <b>-£19,413.49</b> | <b>-£19,831.76</b> |
| Income   | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Total</b>                                     | <b>-£20,373.80</b> | <b>-£18,613.14</b> | <b>-£19,007.40</b> | <b>-£19,413.49</b> | <b>-£19,831.76</b> |
| <b>Cumulative Total</b>                          | <b>-£20,373.80</b> | <b>-£38,986.94</b> | <b>-£57,994.34</b> | <b>-£77,407.82</b> | <b>-£97,239.58</b> |

| 4. Netbooks                                      |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
|--|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|  | Year 0             | Year 1              | Year 2              | Year 3              | Year 4              |
| <b>Hardware And Accessories</b>                  |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Hardware costs                                   | -£14,580.00        | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Additional devices (e.g. mouse, printer, screen) | -£5,400.00         | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Annual service charge                            | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Replacement Hardware Costs                       | £0.00              | -£2,430.00          | -£2,502.90          | -£2,577.99          | -£2,655.33          |
| <b>Software and Security</b>                     |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Warranty for hardware                            | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Security/GCSX                                    | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Software licence costs                           | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Printing and Postage</b>                      |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Printing costs for agendas and reports           | -£9,586.29         | -£9,873.88          | -£10,170.10         | -£10,475.20         | -£10,789.45         |
| Postage costs for agendas and reports            | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          |
| Member's toner costs                             | -£1,713.69         | -£1,765.10          | -£1,818.05          | -£1,872.60          | -£1,928.77          |
| <b>Internal Support</b>                          |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| ICT Member Support (dedicated post)              | -£29,815.00        | -£30,709.45         | -£31,630.73         | -£32,579.66         | -£33,557.05         |
| Internal training costs                          | -£362.66           | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total Expenditure</b>                         | <b>-£66,928.80</b> | <b>-£50,249.59</b>  | <b>-£51,592.94</b>  | <b>-£52,976.60</b>  | <b>-£54,401.76</b>  |
| Income   | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total</b>                                     | <b>-£66,928.80</b> | <b>-£50,249.59</b>  | <b>-£51,592.94</b>  | <b>-£52,976.60</b>  | <b>-£54,401.76</b>  |
| <b>Cumulative Total</b>                          | <b>-£66,928.80</b> | <b>-£117,178.39</b> | <b>-£168,771.33</b> | <b>-£221,747.93</b> | <b>-£276,149.69</b> |

| 5.Duos   |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
|--|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|  | Year 0             | Year1               | Year 2              | Year 3              | Year 4              |
| <b>Hardware And Accessories</b>                  |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Hardware costs                                   | -£23,814.00        | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Additional devices (e.g. mouse, printer, screen) | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Annual service charge                            | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Replacement Hardware Costs                       | £0.00              | -£6,012.00          | -£6,192.36          | -£6,378.13          | -£6,569.47          |
| <b>Software and Security</b>                     |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Warranty for hardware                            | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Security/GCSX                                    | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| Software licence costs                           | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Printing and Postage</b>                      |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| Printing costs for agendas and reports           | -£9,586.29         | -£9,873.88          | -£10,170.10         | -£10,475.20         | -£10,789.45         |
| Postage costs for agendas and reports            | -£5,471.16         | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          | -£5,471.16          |
| Member's toner costs                             | -£1,713.69         | -£1,765.10          | -£1,818.05          | -£1,872.60          | -£1,928.77          |
| <b>Additional Support</b>                        |                    |                     |                     |                     |                     |
| ICT support costs                                | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| ICT Member Support (dedicated post)              | -£29,815.00        | -£30,709.45         | -£31,630.73         | -£32,579.66         | -£33,557.05         |
| Internal training costs                          | -£362.66           | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total Expenditure</b>                         | <b>-£70,762.80</b> | <b>-£53,831.59</b>  | <b>-£55,282.40</b>  | <b>-£56,776.74</b>  | <b>-£58,315.91</b>  |
| Income   | £0.00              | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               | £0.00               |
| <b>Total</b>                                     | <b>-£70,762.80</b> | <b>-£53,831.59</b>  | <b>-£55,282.40</b>  | <b>-£56,776.74</b>  | <b>-£58,315.91</b>  |
| <b>Cumulative Total</b>                          | <b>-£70,762.80</b> | <b>-£124,594.39</b> | <b>-£179,876.79</b> | <b>-£236,653.53</b> | <b>-£294,969.44</b> |

| 6.Member Allowance                     |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
|--|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
|  | Year 0             | Year 1             | Year 2             | Year 3             | Year 4             |
| <b>Member ICT Allowance</b>            |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| ICT Allowance                          | -£21,600.00        | -£21,600.00        | -£21,600.00        | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Printing and Postage</b>            |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| Printing costs for agendas and reports | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Postage costs for agendas and reports  | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Member's toner costs                   | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Internal Support</b>                |                    |                    |                    |                    |                    |
| ICT Member Support (dedicated post)    | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| Internal training costs                | -£362.66           | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Total Expenditure</b>               | <b>-£21,962.66</b> | <b>-£21,600.00</b> | <b>-£21,600.00</b> | <b>£0.00</b>       | <b>£0.00</b>       |
| Income                                 | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              | £0.00              |
| <b>Total</b>                           | <b>-£21,962.66</b> | <b>-£21,600.00</b> | <b>-£21,600.00</b> | <b>£0.00</b>       | <b>£0.00</b>       |
| <b>Cumulative Total</b>                | <b>-£21,962.66</b> | <b>-£43,562.66</b> | <b>-£65,162.66</b> | <b>-£65,162.66</b> | <b>-£65,162.66</b> |





## **Briefing Note - the taxation of Members' Allowances**

The option to pay an allowance to Members to cover the cost of providing their own hardware and support gives rise to a taxable benefit under current regulations, in the same way that the basic allowance is treated as taxable earnings. However, in the same way that the basic allowance can be offset by expenses to reduce or eliminate tax exposure, expenses incurred in purchasing equipment, support and consumables in carrying out the duties of a district councillor can also be claimed.

Central government has provided general guidance on the taxation of members' allowances which can be found at the following link:

<http://www.hmrc.gov.uk/manuals/eimanual/EIM65970.htm>

This guidance covers

- the relevant tax rules
- which allowances are taxable
- the treatment of expenses incurred by a member carrying out approved duties which are reimbursed by the authority
- what tax relief is available for expenses that the authority does not reimburse.

It may be possible for the authority to be granted a dispensation to avoid having to treat the allowances as a taxable payment. Where an allowance is clearly intended to do no more than reimburse expenses actually incurred in carrying out the councillor's duties, and the expense was incurred only because of the office, HMRC may be prepared to authorise payment of the allowance without deducting tax. Before doing this, they will need to be satisfied, however, that the allowance is at a reasonable scale and is clearly intended to do no more than reimburse expenses actually incurred. This would mean that no private use of the equipment would be allowed

Should the option to provide a laptop be chosen then a dispensation would also be required to prevent the supply of equipment being taxed, as tax rules on the supply of computer equipment changed in 2006. Any application for a dispensation would be dealt with by the Payroll Manager on behalf of the authority, rather than individual members.

---

**BRECKLAND COUNCIL**

**At a Meeting of the**

**BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT SUB-COMMITTEE**

**Held on Wednesday, 30 March 2011 at 9.30 am in  
Dereham Room, Conference Suite, Elizabeth House, Walpole Loke, Dereham NR19  
1EE**

**PRESENT**

Mr W.H.C. Smith (Chairman)      Lady Fisher  
Mr P.D. Claussen

**Also Present**

Mr J.P. Cowen

**In Attendance**

|                 |                                       |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------|
| Adam Colby      | - Senior Business Improvement Officer |
| Mark Finch      | - Head of Finance                     |
| Andrew Head     | - ICT Members Support Officer         |
| Helen McAleer   | - Senior Committee Officer            |
| Stephen McGrath | - Member Services Manager             |
| Maxine O'Mahony | - Director of Corporate Resources     |
| Kevin J Taylor  | - Head of ICT                         |

**Action By**

**30/11 APOLOGIES (AGENDA ITEM 1)**

None.

**31/11 URGENT BUSINESS (AGENDA ITEM 2)**

None.

**32/11 DECLARATION OF INTERESTS (AGENDA ITEM 3)**

No declarations were made.

**33/11 NON-MEMBERS WISHING TO ADDRESS THE MEETING (AGENDA  
ITEM 4)**

Mr P Cowen was in attendance (as Chairman of the Joint Audit & Scrutiny Panel).

**34/11 ICT OPTIONS FOR MEMBERS (AGENDA ITEM 5)**

The Chairman explained that the Joint Audit & Scrutiny Panel (JASP) had been set up to look into the options for replacement IT equipment for Members which would provide best value, for both Members and tax payers.

**Action By**

He thanked the JASP Chairman and Panel for all the work they had done. That work would help to inform the public on the reasons why new equipment was needed and to ensure them that, in this time of economic retrenchment, the Council was looking for value for money.

Mr Cowen, Chairman of the JASP, said it had been an interesting exercise which had taken longer than expected due to the advent of Shared Services with South Holland which had delayed the process.

The equipment had to provide best value, connectivity, security and accessibility. It had been hoped that it would be ready in time for issue to new Members following the election on 5 May.

At their last meeting on 2 March 2011 the Panel had received a report with costs and options. Some of the information in that report had been challenged and further evidence had been requested, particularly in regard to tablets, which were known to be being trialled at other authorities. Questions had been asked of those authorities, but no answers had been received. However, on the traffic light evaluation system in the report, it was clear that tablets had functionality restrictions as well as being financially unviable.

Of the six options put forward, only three were considered to be appropriate:

Option 6 – Allowance

This option was considered suitable for a limited number of Members for whom a separate computer was not appropriate: some 'twin-hatters' (District and County Councillors) would already have suitable hardware provided by Norfolk County Council; some Members did not want two computers; some worked for organisations which supplied computers; and some did not have room for two computers in their homes.

Options 1 – Laptop and 4 – Netbook

There had been no preference between these two options which both relied on good Broadband connection.

The Netbook was good because of its size. If the authority was moving towards being paperless, Netbooks would be easily transportable and would not create a barrier at meetings in the way that a laptop might. However, some documents were very substantial and contained a mix of text, tables, diagrams and graphics. If Netbooks were the preferred option they would need the following additional items:

- a large screen for ease of reading larger documents
- a CD drive as some information was provided to Members on CDs
- a full size keyboard and mouse

Other essential items were scanners and printers. The ability to have video conferencing had also been discussed. This would help to reduce the amount of travelling needed.

Members also took very seriously the issue of support. It was felt that there was a lack of understanding of the way that Members worked. Many had jobs and did most of their Council work early in the morning,

**Action By**

later in the evening or at the weekends. Those were the times when they needed support. Members also needed to be able to work whilst 'in transit' on trains, etc and during short periods of free time, between meetings for example.

The JASP Chairman thanked the Officers for the work they had done which had enabled the Panel to arrive at an informed conclusion. The Panel's recommendations had been presented to the Overview & Scrutiny Commission at their meeting on 24 March 2011 and the recommendations had been supported. At the Commission meeting Members had also stressed the importance of out of hours support.

The Head of ICT noted that a clear message had been received about the need for out of hours support for Members. However, he suggested that support was outside the current remit which was to decide on future IT hardware.

The Chairman of BISC suggested that the allowance option would give Members the freedom to choose whichever equipment they wanted, subject to meeting pre-agreed criteria/specifications.

The Chairman of JASP said that the cost of supporting that option was the problem. Support costs were included in the report and had formed part of JASPs determination. However there was a need for additional equipment, such as screens/printers, etc and it was not clear whether those costs were included in the report.

The Director of Corporate Resources suggested that as support was being discussed the Member Support Officer should leave the room, which he did.

The Chairman of BISC agreed that Member support was vital but that it could be provided in another format and that other authorities managed without a dedicated officer.

The Director of Corporate Resources explained that they were considering changing the way that Members were supported. The current system had a very high call-out rate due to the ageing equipment, which was also expensive in terms of mileage. The provision of new hardware and other improvements should reduce that need.

The Head of ICT advised that Citrix was critical for both Members and Officers especially when travelling between sites and in future support would be focussed on ensuring that the Citrix service was highly resilient.

To make best use of resources and to deliver a more standardised service (which could apply to South Holland Members as well) the plan was to deliver Members support from a pool of resources. This would provide much more knowledge across the team and valuable cover in the event of leave/sickness, etc, as well as ensuring that the Authority's health and safety obligations and working time initiatives were met. It should also lead to a reduction in mileage through ensuring that the hardware and back-office systems were working.

The Chairman of BISC added that it would be important for Members to

**Action By**

receive training to ensure that they knew how to use the equipment. That would also lead to a reduction in support calls.

Discussion turned to the financial implications if the allowance option was chosen. The Head of Finance advised that an allowance would be taxable, but that any expenses incurred, such as printer cartridges, paper, etc could be offset against the taxable liability. From a value for money perspective, option 6 was the most cost effective as it did not have any up-front capital injection.

The Chairman of JASP was concerned about public perception. He felt that the ICT support costs in the report were distorted. The JASP recommendation had been based on functionality not figures.

The Head of Finance distributed a Proforma B of the first year's figures.

Members discussed the issues further and raised various concerns:

- taxation of allowances, particularly for Councillors with jobs
- the inclusion of printing and postage costs in the report
- the cost of support
- public perception of Members receiving allowances for equipment – especially in the case of 'twin-hatters' who were provided with hardware by Norfolk County Council

The Senior Business Improvement Officer suggested that the printing and support costs should be removed from the report.

The BISC Chairman agreed and said that costs and taxation needed looking into. He suggested that the JASP should have one final meeting now that those issues were known. The points raised needed to be clarified.

He sought the views of the two other BISC Members and they both agreed that Option 6 looked best. He therefore asked that the Panel look at that option first and if they decided it was not viable, to consider Option 1 (as Option 4 needed too many add-ons).

The JASP Chairman asked the Head of ICT to provide the Panel with a summary of how the allowance option would be supported. He also asked him to write a specification for the equipment, including security expectations. A new Protocol would be needed to ensure that Members complied with the requirements. He raised concerns about the potential for equipment misuse and hoped that the Protocol would make clear Members' responsibilities.

It was **AGREED** that a final JASP meeting would be held, before the next BISC meeting, to consider options 6 and 1, with updated figures and costings.

The meeting closed at 11.05 am

CHAIRMAN